
XTM 1.1

Last changes

Status

- **Last vote**
 - Yes, without comments: Canada, Italy, Korea, Netherlands
 - Yes, with comments: Norway, UK, US
 - No, unless comments accepted: Japan (email not received by secretariat)
 - XTM therefore now approved as FCD
- **Quality of comments received was high**
 - most of the received comments deal with wordsmithing, and so will not be covered in this meeting
 - many will be rejected for technical reasons already discussed in meetings; these will therefore not be covered in the meeting either
- **This means that this is the last chance to make non-trivial changes**
- **After this, XTM 1.1 will be pretty much cast in stone...**

General: URI vs IRI

- **Japan**
 - "URI should be changed to IRI because an IRI is a sequence of characters from the Universal Character Set (Unicode/ISO 10646) and allows to use non-Latin scripts in it."

General: URI references to ISO standards

- **UK**
 - "All URIs referencing part of the standards should be clearly identified as being owned by ISO. Either they should be changed to the agreed ISO format for identifying standards or it should be made clear on the home page of www.topicmaps.org that the namespace is one that is registered as being owned by ISO SC34 members."

Clause 4.12: The instanceOf element

- **Norway**
 - "In `<topic><instanceOf id="x"/>` the id should turn into a source locator on the association item created in the TMDM representation. This avoids throwing away an identifier, and also makes it possible to use `<instanceOf>` even when the association is being reified."

Clause 5.2.7: Canonicalizing embedded XML

- **UK**
 - "Canonicalization is applied to XML data when the datatype specifies the "XML" data type. If the datatype specifies a non-XML data type (e.g. string) but the content is XML markup, is this an error ?"

Clause 5.13: The occurrence element

- **UK**
 - "The deserialisation process does not allow markup in user-defined data types. Either allow markup in user-defined data types or restrict data typing to xml, uri and string and resolve user-defined data types through xml namespaces on the xml data type values."

Clause 5.15: The member element

- **Norway**
 - "The rule that topics are auto-generated in <member> when the player is not specified should be revisited. Either a convention for auto-generating a source locator for such topics should be defined, or else the requirement that all topics have a URI identity should be removed."

Clause 4.4: The topic element

- **Norway**
 - "Requiring an id attribute on <topic> elements is unnecessary and leads to problems. If the topic has a subject identifier or locator this can (and should) be used to refer to it, and so in these cases the id is not needed. Not requiring the id will encourage the use of PSIs, which is the preferred alternative. Requiring the id leads to problems when topic maps are maintained in persistent stores over a long time and updated by regular imports during which duplicated ids may lead to undesired merging.
 - "Make the id attribute on <topic> optional. Modify the RELAX-NG schema so that <topic> elements must either have an id or have a <subjectIdentity> element with content."

Clause 7.4: Variant name scopes

- **Norway**
 - "The display name PSI should be removed. It no longer serves any purpose now that the topic naming constraint has been removed."